Evidence-based Argument: Raising the Level of Logic, Critical Thinking, and Argument Writing in Classrooms and Across a School

Presented by
Mary Ehrenworth

TEACHERS COLLEGE
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
Teachers College Reading and Writing Project
Columbia University
Box 77, 525 West 120th Street
New York, NY, 10027
http://www.readingandwritingproject.com
Mary Ehrenworth, Ed.D., is Deputy Director at the Teachers College Reading and Writing Project, Columbia University. She is the co-author and author of many books and articles, including: *Pathways to the Common Core; The Research Based Argument Essay; The Power of Grammar; Looking to Write; Teaching Reading Through Fantasy Novels*; and several units in the Teaching Writing Grade by Grade Series (TCRWP). Mary is a speaker and staff developer in children’s and adolescent literacy, as well as global education, in school districts across the nation and internationally. From that day long ago when a beloved teacher gave her *The Secret Garden*, to the days she spends now sitting next to children and teachers helping them become powerful and passionate readers and writers, Mary has been lucky enough to spend her time among things she loves best: books, kids, and teachers.

Contact Mary Ehrenworth at:

mary@readingandwritingproject.com

@MaryEhrenworth

If you are interested in any Professional Development Services, please contact Kathy Neville at kathy@readingandwritingproject.com.

http://www.readingandwritingproject.com
# Table of Contents

- Unit Overview Guide ........................................................................................................ 4
- Argument Talk Rules ......................................................................................................... 5
- Sample Checklists: 4<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> ................................................................. 6
- On Demand Essay Writing Samples.............................................................................. 9
- Additional Text Resources for Research-Based Argument Essay .............................. 11
- Literature Essay Samples.............................................................................................. 12
- Fifth Grade Performance Assessment and Samples .................................................. 15
- Prompts for Writing On Demand Assessments......................................................... 24
Overview for Grade 5 Unit 4, *The Research-Based Argument Essay*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Session/Minilesson</th>
<th>Conferring and Small-Group Work</th>
<th>Mid-Workshop Teaching</th>
<th>Share</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>BEND I: Establishing and Supporting Positions</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Investigating to Understand an Argument</td>
<td>Coaching into Students' Research and Note-Taking</td>
<td>The Source for Your Information Matters! Noting Bibliographic Information</td>
<td>Writers Use Evidence to Form and Build an Opinion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Flash-Drafting Arguments</td>
<td>Students' Work Can Help You Plan for Future Teaching</td>
<td>When You're Done, You've Just Begun</td>
<td>Writers Reread and Make Writing Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Using Evidence to Build Arguments</td>
<td>Predictable Problems with Adding Evidence</td>
<td>Writers Consider Not Only Quantity but Also Relevance of Text Evidence</td>
<td>Setting Goals and Working toward Them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Using Quotations to Bolster an Argument</td>
<td>Teaching Children to Control Their Use of Quotations</td>
<td>Using Transitional Phrases between Writing and a Quotation</td>
<td>Introducing the Source, Explaining the Tie-In</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Letter to Teachers: Redrafting to Add More Evidence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Balancing Evidence with Analysis</td>
<td>Marking Up Writing for Important Parts: Claim, Evidence, and Thinking</td>
<td>Whittle Away Everything that Doesn't Support the Point</td>
<td>Setting the Context for a Quotation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Letter to Teachers: Signed, Sealed, Delivered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**BEND II: Building Powerful Arguments**

| 8 Taking Arguments Up a Notch | Tools Matter | Maximizing Your Note-Taking System: Researching and Writing a Lot | Writers Study Other Writers' Note-Taking Systems and Choose One that Works Best for Them |
| 9 Bringing a Critical Perspective to Writing | Supporting Students Who Struggle to Make Connections across Texts | Thinking through Evidence, Point by Point | Writers Draw from Earlier Drafts |
| 10 Rehearsing the Whole, Refining a Part | Support Students to Write with Focus—Fast and Furious | Front-End Revision Is Easier than Back-End Revision | Study a Mentor Conclusion for Qualities of Strong Endings |
| 11 Rebuttals, Responses, and Counterclaims | Supporting Writers Who Are Ready to Contextualize Arguments within Larger Ideas and Writers Who Need Support with Lining Up Evidence | Useful Prompts for Rebutting Counterclaims | Where to Include Counterclaims and Rebuttals |
| 12 Evaluating Evidence | Analyzing Logic in Claims and Counterclaims | Be on the Lookout for Flawed Arguments—and if Necessary, Return to Research | Unpacking the Strengths and Weaknesses of Evidence for Readers |
| 13 Appealing to the Audience | Understanding Your Audience | Choosing the Right Words for a Particular Audience | Getting to Know Your Audience Even Better |

**BEND III: Writing for Real-Life Purposes and Audiences**

| 14 Letter to Teachers: A Mini-Celebration: Panel Presentations, Reflection, and Goal-Setting | | | |
| 15 Letter to Teachers: Argument across the Curriculum | | | |
| **16 Taking Opportunities to Stand and Be Counted** | Finding a Topic and Planning Your Essay with Audience in Mind | Writers Plan with an Eye on the Deadline | Writers Take Charge of Their Writing Lives and Plan Their Next Moves |
| 17 Everyday Research | Coaching into Students' Search for Primary Evidence | A Short Project Can Lead to Many More | Writers Include Their Journeys of Thought in Their Drafts |
| 18 Letter to Teachers: Taking Stock and Setting Writing Tasks | | | |
| 19 Letter to Teachers: Using All You Know from Other Types of Writing to Make Your Arguments More Powerful | | | |
| 20 Evaluating the Validity of Your Argument | Playing Devil's Advocate and Spotting the Biased Sample | Quick Debates to Test Accuracy and Precision | Writers Add Detailed Explanations to Defend Their Position |
| 21 Paragraphing Choices | Sorting Information within Paragraphs | Writers Are Daring, and They Are Problem Solvers | Writers Collaborate, Using a Variety of Ways to Help Each Other Edit |
| 22 Letter to Teachers: Celebration: Taking Positions, Developing Stances | | | |
Argument Talk Rules

1. Name the Argument.

2. Listen and gather evidence for both sides of the argument.
   - You should be able to argue either way.
   - Be alert to juicy quotes and statistics.

3. Pick a side.

4. Caucus with your side:
   - What is your BEST evidence?
     - Sort through and weigh your evidence to find the strongest
     - Rehearse your argument.

5. Face off!
   - Meet your opponent and present your argument...and listen to theirs.
   - You will have one minute each to present your argument.

6. Repeat back to your opponent the BEST part of their argument.
   - What evidence was most compelling or persuasive?

7. Caucus with your side again to plan rebuttal.
   - What were the opposition’s strongest arguments and
     how can your side rebut?
   - A rebuttal should not just be a restatement of your initial argument!

8. Rebuttal with opponent (1 minute).

9. Come up with “Position C” with your opponent.
   - Can you name a position that is more complex?
## Opinion Writing Checklist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structure</th>
<th>NOT YET</th>
<th>STARTING TO</th>
<th>YES!</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall</strong></td>
<td>I made a claim about a topic or a text and tried to support my reasons.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lead</strong></td>
<td>I wrote a few sentences to hook my readers, perhaps by asking a question, explaining why the topic mattered, telling a surprising fact, or giving background information.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I stated my claim.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transitions</strong></td>
<td>I used words and phrases to glue parts of my piece together. I used phrases such as <em>for example, another example, one time,</em> and <em>for instance</em> to show when I was shifting from saying reasons to giving evidence and <em>in addition to, also,</em> and <em>another</em> to show when I wanted to make a new point.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ending</strong></td>
<td>I wrote an ending for my piece in which I restated and reflected on my claim, perhaps suggesting an action or response based on what I had written.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td>I separated sections of information using paragraphs.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Development

### Elaboration

| Craft | I gave reasons to support my opinion. I chose the reasons to convince my readers. | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
| | I included examples and information to support my reasons, perhaps from a text, my knowledge, or my life. | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |

### Language Conventions

#### Spelling

| Spelling | I used what I know about word families and spelling rules to help me spell and edit. I used the word wall and dictionaries to help me when needed. | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |

#### Punctuation

| Punctuation | When writing long complex sentences, I used commas to make them clear and correct. | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
| | I used periods to fix my run-on sentences. | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
Student Facing Checklist for Opinion Writing, Grade 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opinion Checklist</th>
<th>Yes!</th>
<th>Starting To</th>
<th>Not Yet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grade 7</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Structure</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overall</strong></td>
<td>I not only staked a position that can be well-supported by a variety of evidence, I also considered positions on the topic or text that might disagree with my own position. I built to a conclusion which still let readers know that my own position is valid and makes sense.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lead</strong></td>
<td>Not only did I make sure that my introduction fits with the whole of my piece, I also considered how best to angle the information I give about the topic or text in order to get the reader ready to see my print. I made it clear to readers what my piece will argue.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transitions</strong></td>
<td>I used transition to make it clear when I am staying with one line of thinking and when I am following or refuting another. Transitions such as for instance, in addition, also and therefore help my reader stay with one line of thinking. Transitions such as nevertheless, on the other hand, let my reader know when I am moving to a different line of thinking.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ending</strong></td>
<td>In the conclusion, I returned to the sides of the argument and reiterated how the support for my claim outweighed the counterclaim.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td>I grouped my reasons and related evidence into paragraphs. The parts of my piece are arranged purposefully to suit my purpose. I may have used compare/ contrast, order of importance or sequence as organizing structures in my piece. I distinguished between parts of the text that support the claim and parts that acknowledge and/or refute a counterclaim.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Development</strong></td>
<td>I developed a variety of reasons, supported by evidence, to argue my claim. These reasons and evidence are supported by detailed, precise examples. I included trustworthy and significant sources and analyzed the relevance of these sources. I related textual evidence back to my argument and made it clear how it strengthens my claim. Not only did I acknowledge counterclaims while being careful to separate them from my claim, I can also say which fact and details make the claim strongest.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

©Units of Study for Teaching Writing, Grade by Grade: A Yearlong Workshop Curriculum, Grades K-8, by Lucy Calkins and Colleagues (Heinemann, 2013/2014)
For distribution only in TCRWP schools
DRAFT
### Description

I do not just rely on buzz words to evoke emotion from the reader (e.g. it is dangerous, critical, horrible). I chose precise words and used some analogies or comparisons to explain what I meant and to achieve an intended effect. I cut any words that do not help me get my meaning across exactly.

I considered different meanings of words, including technical and figurative and thought about the impact of specific words on the mood of my piece.

Not only did I make choices about how to give my evidence, I also made choices about the way I analyze the evidence to get readers to follow my line of thinking.

Not only have I matched the tone or parts of my argument to the meaning and purpose of that part, changing my tone deliberately to match my content, I have also used a consistently formal tone.

### Language Conventions

#### Spelling

I matched the spelling of technical vocabulary to that found in resources and text evidence. I spelled material in citations correctly.

#### Punctuation

I used accurate citation. I used punctuation to clarify quotations and to emphasize meaning.
Schools should keep serving chocolate milk to us! I love chocolate milk, and my friends love chocolate milk! Everyone loves chocolate milk. They make strawberry milk as well, and they should serve that too. We should serve chocolate milk because it tastes good and because it has some good vitamins.

Chocolate milk tastes like...chocolate! Who doesn’t like chocolate? Everyone likes chocolate. Go to a Duane Reade or a Starbucks or a Dean and Delucca. What do you see at the counter, luring in the kiddies and the adults? CHOCOLATE. Chocolate makes us happy. School does not always make us happy. So keep serving chocolate milk. It is an oasis of sweetness. I think even the teachers would find they liked school more, if they drank more chocolate milk.

In addition, chocolate milk has some stuff that’s good for you. It has vitamins, and calcium. Put away those sodas and gatorade. Drink milk. Just exercise too, and the sugar will melt away, leaving only the happiness.
Schools should keep serving chocolate milk for young children. There should be chocolate milk because kids like it, it gives vitamins, and it gets kids in good habits. I do like chocolate milk. But that's not why schools should serve it. Research shows that chocolate milk is pretty good for kids.

First I'll explain why it's important that kids like chocolate milk. It turns out that more kids drink milk when they can get chocolate milk. When you interview a lot of parents, like Katie Couric did, they'll say that their kids only drink milk if they can get chocolate milk. So at least they're drinking milk.

Next I'll show how chocolate milk turns out to have vitamins. A famous nutritionist shows that chocolate milk is a good source of vitamin A, D, E, and calcium. That's a lot of vitamins and they're in something you actually like to drink! This famous nutritionist has two kids, and she lets them drink chocolate milk, and those kids look pretty healthy. One girl has really white teeth and shiny hair. This nutritionist works for the Dairy Association, so she must have studied how good milk is for you.

There's one more reason why chocolate milk should be served in schools. The famous nutritionist showed that chocolate milk has a lot less sugar and carbohydrates than soda and power drinks like gatorade. So if kids get in the habit of drinking milk in school, then they'll probably skip the sodas outside of school. The famous nutritionist didn't actually say this as a fact, this is my interpretation, but it was the facts her kids pointed out about how soda has more sugar, that made me think of it.

That's why we should keep serving chocolate milk at our middle school – it gets kids to drink milk, it gives us vitamins, and it builds good habits. Now that's all clear, as an aside, last spring, my fifth grade studied chocolate milk, and we ended up having no chocolate milk in the cafeteria in June, and it was a bummer. I just stopped drinking period. Until we were allowed to go out to lunch in the spring of fifth grade, and then I started going out for pizza and a coke, and one reason is because there was NO CHOCOLATE MILK. What about that, Jamie Oliver? Jamie is a famous English chef who for some reason also makes lunch for kids in schools in Los Angeles. He showed that a bus full of sugar sort of compares to how much sugar we get from chocolate milk in school. But if you start making those comparisons, we wouldn't be able to eat anything from school lunches. In fact, the vitamins from chocolate milk are probably the only ones we get in our school lunch. So keep chocolate milk, our main source of vitamins, good habits, and happiness.
Some Additional Texts for Research-Based Argument Essay

As always, we encourage you to preview these texts before showing them to your students. Some texts are better suited than others for any particular class. And please, feel free to write with your suggestions for other texts!

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>URL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sugar Overload: clip from Australian news discussing how Jamie Oliver has convinced LA schools to ban chocolate milk. Citizens in Australia are interviewed about their feelings.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eQwGDI56Zg">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eQwGDI56Zg</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flavored Milk: Tasty Nutrition: video clip showing a nurse for the Mid-West Dairy organization explaining the benefits of chocolate milk.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Mo3qso5974">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Mo3qso5974</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study about students drinking less milk when only regular milk is offered. Study is funded, in part, by Milk Processor Education Program. (The Milk Processor Education Program (MilkPEP), Washington, D.C., is funded by the nation’s milk processors, who are committed to increasing fluid milk consumption.)</td>
<td><a href="http://www.whymilk.com/studies_print.php?study=milk_consumption_in_schools_dropped">http://www.whymilk.com/studies_print.php?study=milk_consumption_in_schools_dropped</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad by the National Dairy Council showing benefits of chocolate milk</td>
<td><a href="http://www.nationaldairycouncil.org/SiteCollectionDocuments/child_nutrition/health_kit/FinalFlavoredMilkAdvertorial110909.pdf">http://www.nationaldairycouncil.org/SiteCollectionDocuments/child_nutrition/health_kit/FinalFlavoredMilkAdvertorial110909.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raise your Hand for Chocolate Milk: video clip showing a dietician who works for a Dairy organization explaining the benefits of chocolate milk.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=t1XGy45F210">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=t1XGy45F210</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raise your Hand for Chocolate Milk: celebrities and authors of books on health discuss why they are pro-chocolate milk.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RjKFlusWXc&amp;feature=related">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RjKFlusWXc&amp;feature=related</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moo TV: a video made by grade 4 students to campaign against chocolate milk. They were inspired by a video clip their teacher showed them (Jamie Oliver’s show).</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZsUE57vea0">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZsUE57vea0</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When we were reading the Frog and Toad story, Alone, by Arnold Lobel, the most important part for me was when we talked about metaphor. Metaphor is when something which seems ordinary is really something grand. In Alone, Toad is upset. His best friend, Frog, leaves him a note saying he wants to be alone. In his great upset, Toad searches for Frog everywhere. At the end of his quest (a quest is a grand journey where you seek something important), Toad discovers Frog sitting on an island in the stream.

The island in the stream is a metaphor! If it were just an island in the story then it would just be a wet rock. It is more than a wet rock. It is a metaphor for solitude. Solitude means being alone because you want to be alone. Not lonely alone but good alone. The island in Alone is a metaphor for the place we all need when we need to just be quiet and by ourselves.

When we read this story, I thought that I need an island like that too. I have younger sisters who share my room and sometimes they seem like Toad. They are easily upset. They are twins so when one gets upset the other does too. It is as if Frog had two Toads who always want to be with him and never leave him alone. The note would never have worked with two Toads. One would read it and cry and the other would already be tracking Toad down. So I have made an island of solitude in the corner of the bedroom I share with my sisters.

My island of solitude is made with some pieces of wood my dad put together for me. My mom sewed a cover from pale blue cloth. When the light comes through the blue it is like being in a cloud – it is a floating island. When the cloth door is rolled down, then my twin sisters know that I am in my floating island of solitude. The door is my note - I am Frog, alone in my island.

I love this story because it showed me that you can make metaphors in your life. Someone might say that I just have a blue box in our room. But they would be missing the grand metaphor.

Danielle
Literature Essay Sample

At first it seems that The Hunger Games trilogy is about sacrifice. But later, the theme that emerges more strongly is one of betrayal. Reader, before going any farther, if you haven’t yet read The Hunger Games trilogy, by Suzanne Collins, then you should put this essay aside, grab your car keys or your subway pass, and get to a book store. You'll be lucky to find it, as it disappears off the shelves as fast as book stores can stock it. It’s a story about death, and fear, and unbearable loss. Yet along with that death, fear, and loss, there is courage, and loyalty, and sacrifice.

It’s important that you understand where this story takes place, Panem, before untangling what the story might be about. It’s a place a bit in the future, after things have changed, probably due to a nuclear war. The Capitol of Panem has all the power and all the technology, and it keeps the districts subservient. And then there are the Hunger Games. Here’s how Suzanne Collins describes the Hunger Games:

The rules of the Hunger Games are simple. In punishment for the uprising, each of the twelve districts must provide one girl and one boy, called tributes, to participate. The twenty-four tributes will be imprisoned in a vast outdoor arena that could hold anything from a burning desert to a frozen wasteland. Over a period of several weeks, the competitors must fight to the death. The last tribute standing wins. (The Hunger Games, p. 18)

The Hunger Games seem to be about sacrifice because right from the start, Katniss is willing to sacrifice herself for her family. The story begins as she is going out hunting with Gale, outside the fenced in boundaries of the town. It’s illegal to do this, and if they are caught they could be killed. But Katniss does this because she needs to feed her family. She sacrifices her sense of safety, so that her family can live.

The most gripping early scene of The Hunger Games is one of sacrifice. It is the moment when Gale, Katniss, and her sister Prim, take their chances in the lottery. It’s pretty much of a given that if they are chosen, they will die. Yet each year, Katniss has bought extra tickets, or tesserae, for the lottery. These tesserae have given her family food and oil, but in exchange, Katniss says that she has twenty entries in this year’s lottery. Gale has forty-two. So they have been sacrificing themselves for their families every time. But still, of course, all Katniss hopes is that she won’t be chosen. And Katniss is not chosen…but her sister is. Primrose, her beloved younger sister, is chosen. “I volunteer!” Katniss gasps (p. 22). And she gives herself in her sister’s place, as an act of sacrifice. Katniss achieved a supreme sacrifice at this moment. She did not expect to live. Even if she did, she would be changed, she’d become a killer, a hunter of children.

There is one more moment of sacrifice in the first novel of the series that supports the notion that The Hunger Games is about sacrifice, because not only Katniss, but also Peeta, sacrifice themselves for loved ones. (Reader, I’m going to talk about the ending of the series now, so if you didn’t get to that bookstore, you may want to do that now, and read the books before continuing.) As the games progress, at every turn Peeta tries to protect Katniss. He never intended to win the games at all, he only wanted to help Katniss survive. At the very end of the first novel, only Peeta and Katniss have survived, but only one tribute can live. Katniss picks up her bow, as if she would shoot Peeta, but Peeta throws his knife in the lake, and tells Katniss to kill him, so she can live. “Do it,” he says (p. 343). And somehow, in that moment, as she experiences Peeta’s sacrifice, Katniss is transformed. “You shoot me and go home and live with it!” she says. Then she thinks, “as I say it, I know
death right here, right now, would be the easier of the two” (p. 343). It’s not so much that Katniss loves Peeta, as she comes to love what he stands for, a willingness to sacrifice himself for others, a refusal to bend to the Capitol’s will, a relentless, loyal courage. And so at the end of the first book, perhaps the strongest lesson learned through *The Hunger Games* was of the power of sacrifice. For ultimately, Prim lives, as do Katniss and Peeta. Their willingness to sacrifice themselves for others, saves everyone.

Yet if one thinks *The Hunger Games* was about sacrifice, by the end of the trilogy, one might have thought they were about betrayal. In the second novel, when Peeta and Katniss have to go back into the Games, they both plot and lie to each other, in an effort to ensure that the other will survive. The bigger betrayals, though, come near the end. Near the end of the third novel, *Mockingjay*, there have been countless moments of sacrifice, and an almost equal number of betrayals. Katniss risks her own life to try to protect the wounded during a fire fight with the Capitol. The adults who lead the rebellion against the Capitol use Katniss as a symbol, withholding information from her, manipulating her so she will follow their wishes. It is a web of courageous sacrifices and confusing betrayals—the kinds of betrayals that are made to ‘protect’ people. But then come two enormous betrayals.

The first betrayal is through Peeta. Peeta has been captured by the Capitol. He is tortured, and brainwashed. When Peeta is rescued by the rebellion forces, the first thing he does when he sees Katniss is...try to kill her. This is the moment when the books became more about betrayal than about sacrifice. For all through the novels, Peeta was the one pure character. He was the one who would die for Katniss—but he did not kill. He would not kill for the Capitol. And now they have wrecked him. Whatever they did, they managed to destroy this love. Even if he gets it back, this love will always be damaged. It has cracks in it. So this one perfect thing, this one sacrificial love, is itself betrayed, so that you come away thinking that anything can be destroyed, that there is no force more powerful than violence, and hatred.

That’s not the only moment of torturous betrayal though. At the very end of the third novel (remember, Reader, you were advised to read the books first), Katniss and Peeta find out that the rebellion itself is betrayed. The leader, Coin, wants to reinstitute the Hunger Games. She wants to replace the president of the Capitol, not take down the whole political system. It’s just awful. Everything Katniss and Peeta have been fighting for seems false, and there is no one to trust. And along the way, Prim dies anyway. She dies by a weapon that Gale makes, though he didn’t intend it for her. And so it seems that the sense of betrayal, is stronger than the sense of sacrifice and hope.

At the end, betrayal seems a stronger force than sacrifice in *The Hunger Games*. Their world is most shaped by betrayal. And so Katniss and Peeta retreat from the world, to a kind of haven where they live alone, a lost place that nobody wants. And that in itself is a kind of betrayal, as both characters refuse to go on with the struggle to improve conditions in Panem. What does that say about the world, that there is no hope for change?

In the end, it is possible that sacrifice and betrayal are both part of a bigger concept – love. Maybe where there is love there will often be sacrifice, but there will often be betrayal as well. Katniss and Peeta are betrayed by their community, and so they seek to forge their own place, where they can at least love each other. They show that where there is love, you can survive betrayal. Katniss and Peeta forgive each other for the ways in which they have betrayed each other – the times when they have actively sought to harm or even kill the other, the times they have lied to each other, and even the times they wanted to sacrifice their own lives to save the other, leaving the other alone in the world. Maybe, if they love Panem enough, they will forgive it too.
Fifth Grade Performance Assessment followed by Student Samples

These are sample pieces of student writing collected from the fifth grade performance assessment. These show responses to task 5, the research-based argument essay.
This is the overview of a performance assessment on informational reading and opinion writing. It describes the task students must complete during the course of the assessment.

**Overview of Assessment**

**Note: Suggested teacher prompts follow – please alter and make note of alterations based on your own conversational style and the ways in which you’ve talked about reading and writing nonfiction in your own classroom. The tasks below could be administered in many different ways.**

**Suggested time frame:**

- The introduction and five tasks could be administered in two to four chunks of time, in either one or two days.

**Task 1: Video viewing and summary writing: “Phoenix Zoo Helps Save Endangered Species”**
Students will watch a video entitled —Phoenix Zoo Helps Save Endangered Species! and will be prompted to watch and listen for information about the zoos and their positive and negative effects on endangered animals. After the video is shown a second time, students will be prompted to write a summary to capture more than one main idea and supporting details that they learned from watching the video.

**Task 2: Independent reading and summary writing of “Zoochosis”**
Students will read the article and will be prompted to use their response booklet to write main ideas and key supporting details from the text and to summarize the text.

**Task 3: Independent reading and summary writing of “The Swazi Eleven”**
Students will read the article and will be prompted to use their response booklet to write down main ideas and key supporting details from the text and to summarize the text.

**Task 4: Independent reading and response to “Life Span of Female African Elephants”**
Students will read the chart and will be prompted to summarize main ideas from this text and key details that support those ideas.

**Task 4: Opinion writing: research-based argument essay**
Students will be prompted to write a research-based argument essay in which they state an opinion, and provide reasons and information for that opinion, on the topic of whether funding should be continued or discontinued to support endangered animals’ captivity in zoos. The students will be reminded to meet the expectations for fifth grade opinion writing and to use evidence from the provided reading.
Task 5: (use loose leaf paper for this)  
Research-Based Argument Essay:  
Do Zoos Help or Harm Endangered Animals?

Think about everything you’ve learned today and yesterday. Write a research-based argument essay, convincing readers that zoos either help or harm endangered animals. Be sure to use what you know about writing essays to state a claim and back it up with evidence from your research. As you write, use information and quotations from the video and any or all of the texts you read to support your claim.

Be sure to:
- Make a quick plan for your essay using boxes and bullets or another organizational tool
- Introduce the topic
- State your claim: make clear whether you believe zoos help or harm endangered animals
- Create body paragraphs to organize your reasons
- Include relevant facts and details from the sources you’ve read and watched
- Use transition words to link information and ideas
- Write a conclusion

Plan for essay:
I think, in my own opinion, that zoos should stay. Only if they have indangered animals in them. Not animals that are healthy. I say that because their once was a whale, killer whale, named Junior. He was removed from his habitat in Iceland, and placed in a tank in Niagara Falls. He died four years later. He died. Before any of this happen.

Also, sometimes when animals have this disease called zoochosis, which is what happened to Junior, they start to strange things. Like continuously running around in circles, moving their head and neck around, and tearing holes in their own skin.

Please, don’t do such things like this.

Also, sometimes when animals have this disease called zoochosis, which is what happened to Junior, they start to strange things. Like continuously running around in circles, moving their head and neck around, and tearing holes in their own skin.

I say that because... Also...

DRAFT
5th Grade Writing Sample

People are wondering if animals are better off in the wild, or in zoos. Well I think animals should be in the wild.

I think animals should be in the wild because sometimes the animals aren't as free. In the article "Zoochosis" it said "Animals kept in cages were grabbing onto the bars and shaking them also." If you could look into the animals' eyes, you would have seen deep sadness! This shows that animals are better off in the wild, because they aren't as free.

Another reason why animals are better off in the wild because of their life spans. For the African Elephants, in the wild they are 56 years, but in zoos it's 17 years. For the Asian Elephants it's 42 years in the wild, and in the zoos it's 19 years! This proves that animals are better off in the wild.

In conclusion this proves that animals live better in the wild than the zoos!
Do you like zoos? Ever think about if the animals like zoos? Well, I can tell you first hand they don't! Zoos may be entertaining and all but it's not the animals trying to entertain you there trying to tell you why did you put this to me? Why aren't you helping me? Do you think zoos should stay? Because I don't!

Zoos are not good for animals. They can lose their natural species instinct. For example, in a article called zooschosis, animals like whales and dolphins who are use to haring down up to 100 miles per day are forced to be put into a small confined space. Another animal with zooschosis is it spoke of how dolphins have a special way of talking to each other and finding there prey. They use patterns of sound that is called echolocation. This is sometimes extinct in aquariums because of the high noise level.

So, how if you are thinking well zoos help keep the animals healthy so it's all well. That is not true. For example, in zooschosis talks about a disease called zooschosis. Some symptoms of the animals are pressing back and forth, twisting...
Do you think zoo's should stay? Because I don't!

Zoo's are not good for animals they can lose there natural species instinct...So now you are thinking well zoos help keep the animals healthy so its ok well that is not true!

Do you like zoo's? Ever think about if the animals like zoo's? Well I can tell you first hand they don't! Zoo's may be entertaining and all but its not the animals trying to entertain you there trying to tell you why did you do this to me? Why aren't you helping me? Do you think zoo's should stay? Because I don't!

This is why zoo's are not good for animals and therefore all zoo's should be closed and the animals there should be let go to roam the earth freely.

For example, in an article called Zoochosis animals like whales and dolphins who are use to diving down up to 100 miles per day are forced to be put into a small confined space...Also on average elephants specifically live 34 years more in the wild than in the zoo!

Another example in Zoochosis is it spoke of how aquatic animals have a speacile way of talking to each other and finding there prey. They use patterns of sound that is called ecolocation this also natural. This is sometimes extinct in aquariums because of the high noise level.
Even though zoos aren’t a perfect solution, we should support zoos because they help protect endangered animals. Sometimes animals are in trouble in the wild. They don’t have enough to eat, or they are endangered.

Sometimes endangered animals are in trouble in the wild because there isn’t enough to eat. For example, Tom French, who won a Pulitzer Prize as a journalist, studied elephants in many zoos, and he wrote a book about them. It’s called Zoo Story. It turns out that there are too many elephants in South Africa. There isn’t enough food for them and there isn’t enough food for the rhino, because the elephants eat all the trees. So when elephants get moved to zoos, it might save their lives and it might help some other animals too. Tom French shows that in good zoos like the one in San Diego, there are clinics with experts who will care for the elephants. The article says "the animal clinic at the San Diego Zoo was better than any hospital in Swaziland."

Another thing that zoos help with is breeding endangered animals. One Fox News program showed how local zoos can help breed endangered animals and then set them back in the wild. That seems like a good idea. If we could use zoos to breed these animals, and then put them back in the wild, maybe they wouldn’t be endangered.

On the other hand, animals in zoos don’t always live a long time. They seem to live a lot longer in the wild. But the chart that shows how long elephants live in the wild is only counting the elephants who live at all. It doesn’t count the ones who die of starvation because there are no trees, or the ones who get shot by poachers. Tom French shows that’s what happens to lots of elephants. You might worry about zoochosis, too. That’s when animals get lonely and sad in zoos. But it sounds like the San Diego zoo takes good care of its elephants. And it’s probably pretty lonely when you face a poacher who wants your tusks.

Overall, it seems like zoos are a good idea, as long as they take good care of the animals. They can rescue endangered animals, and they can breed them so they won’t be so endangered. It would be even better if we could stop destroying their land. But since we’re not endangered, that’s probably not going to happen.

Annotations

Even though zoos aren’t a perfect solution, we should support zoos because they help protect endangered animals.

Sometimes endangered animals are in trouble in the wild because there isn’t enough to eat... So when elephants get moved to zoos, it might save their lives and it might help some other animals too... Another thing that zoos help with is breeding
endangered animals... On the other hand, animals in zoos don’t always live a long
time... But it sounds like the San Diego zoo takes good care of its elephants.
Even though zoos aren’t a perfect solution, we should support zoos because they
help protect endangered animals. Sometimes animals are in trouble in the wild.
They don’t have enough to eat, or they are endangered.

Overall, it seems like zoos are a good idea, as long as they take good care of the
animals. They can rescue endangered animals, and they can breed them so they
won’t be so endangered. It would be even better if we could stop destroying their
land. But since we’re not endangered, that’s probably not going to happen.

For example, Tom French, who won a Pulitzer Prize as a journalist, studied
elephants in many zoos, and he wrote a book about them. It’s called Zoo Story... One
Fox News program showed how local zoos can help breed endangered animals and
then set them back in the wild... You might worry about zoolochemistry, too.

For example... So... Another thing... On the other hand... But... Overall...
These are prompts that can be used each time a teacher gives an on-demand writing assessment. There are prompts for each genre of writing: narrative, information/explanatory, and opinion/argument.

Narrative

“I’m really eager to understand what you can do as writers, so before you do anything else, please spend today writing the best personal narrative, the best small moment story, of a time in your life. This could be a small moment story or it could tell the story of a scene or two. You’ll have 45 minutes to write this true story. You will only have this one period, so you’ll need to plan, draft, revise and edit in one sitting. Write in a way that shows off all that you know about narrative writing.”

Additional Instructions for Narrative:

K-1
In your writing and pictures, make sure you:

• Make a beginning for your story

• Show what happened in order (first, next, last...)

• Use details (action, talk, feelings) to help readers picture what happened

• Make an ending for your story

2-3
In your writing, make sure you:

• Write a beginning for your story

• Use transition words to tell what happened in order (first, next, last...)

• Use details (action, dialogue, feelings, thoughts, description) to help readers picture what happened

• Write an ending for your story

4-8
In your writing, make sure you:

• Write a beginning that gets readers into the world of the story and helps them understand what is going on

• Use details (dialogue, description) to show exactly what happened in the story and how characters were thinking and feeling

• Use transition words to help readers understand how the story holds together and when events happened

• Write an ending, ideally one that connects to what the story is really about
**Informative/Explanatory Writing**

“Think of a topic that you’ve studied or know. Tomorrow, you will have 45 minutes to write an informational (or all-about) text that teaches others interesting and important information and ideas about that topic. If you want to find and use information from a book or another outside source, you may bring that with you tomorrow. Please keep in mind that you’ll have 45 minutes to complete this. You will only have this one period, so you’ll need to plan, draft, revise and edit in one sitting. Write in a way that shows me all that you know about informational writing.”

**Additional Instructions for Informative/Explanatory:**

**K-1**
In your writing and pictures, make sure you:

- Name what topic you will teach about
- Give information (facts, examples) to help you teach readers a lot about your topic
- Make an ending for your teaching book

**2-3**
In your writing, make sure you:

- Write a beginning for your information piece
- Use facts and details (examples, definitions, expert words) to teach readers a lot about your topic
- Use transition words to connect different bits of information together (also, another, and, more, but)
- Write an ending for your information piece

**4-8**
In your writing, make sure you:

- Write a beginning that gets readers interested in the subject and set up to learn more about it
- Include facts and details (examples, anecdotes, statistics, expert words) to teach readers important information and ideas about the subject
- Organize your writing to best teach readers about your subject and use transition words (for example, in contrast, another) to help readers understand how the different bits of information go together
- Write an ending, ideally one that reminds readers why this subject is important
**Opinion/Argument**

“Think of a topic or issue that you know a lot about or that you have strong feelings about. Tomorrow, you will have 45 minutes to write an opinion or argument text in which you will write your opinion or claim and tell reasons why you feel that way. Use everything you know about essays, persuasive letters and reviews. If you want to find and use information from a book or another outside source, you may bring that with you tomorrow. Please keep in mind that you’ll have 45 minutes to complete this, so you will need to plan, draft, revise and edit in one sitting.”

**Additional Instructions for Opinion/Argument:**

**K-1**
In your writing and pictures, make sure you:

- Name your opinion
- Use details to show why you have that opinion
- Make an ending for your opinion piece

**2-3**
In your writing, make sure you:

- Write a beginning for your piece and give your opinion
- Name reasons to show why you have that opinion
- Give evidence (details, facts, examples) to prove your reasons
- Use transition words to show how parts of your writing fit together (also, another, for example)
- Write an ending for your piece

**4-8**
In your writing, make sure you:

- Write a beginning that gets readers to understand and care about your topic and clearly states your claim
- Give reasons for your opinion and support those reasons with evidence (details, anecdotes, examples, facts, quotes)
- Organize your writing to best convince your readers of your claim and use transition words (in addition, consequently, for instance) to show how parts fit together
- Write an ending, ideally one that reminds readers why your opinion is important
- (Acknowledge that there may be other perspectives who disagree with you and address these counterarguments) [6-8]